

# PARLIAMENTARY ACTS

## XIII LEGISLATURE

---

Doc. **XXII-bis**  
n. **1**

### PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE OF INQUIRY INTO THE CERMIS TRAGEDY

*(established with a resolution of the Assembly on 19 October 1999)*

*(composed of the deputies: Iacobellis, President, Marino, Olivieri, Vice Presidents, Rizzi, Saonara, Secretaries; Boato, Brugger, Crema, De Cesaris, Detomas, Di Bisceglie, Fontan, Franz, Frattini, Frigato, Fumagalli Marco, Gazzilli, Giannattasio, Gnaga, Lucchese, Mitolo, Niccolini, Ortolano, Ruffino, Schmid)*

#### **FINAL REPORT**

**(Rapporteur: Luigi OLIVIERI)**

*Approved by the Committee at the session of 7 February 2001*

---

*Submitted to the President  
of the Chamber on 8 February 2001*

---

## CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	7
<b>PART I – THE EVENT AND THE REACTIONS OF ITALIAN INSTITUTIONS</b> .....	9
1. THE EVENT .....	9
1.1 <i>The operational context: Bosnia, Yugoslavia and the operational role of NATO and Italy</i> .....	9
1.2 <i>Description of the flight of 3 February 1998: the impact and its consequences</i> .....	10
1.3 <i>The reaction of Parliament, the Government and local authorities</i> .....	13
<b>PART II – THE GENERAL FRAMEWORK OF THE INQUIRIES CONDUCTED BY THE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE</b> .....	21
1. THE ACTIVITY OF THE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE. HEARINGS AND MISSIONS .....	21
<b>PART III – THE INQUIRIES CONDUCTED AFTER THE TRAGEDY</b> .....	47
1. THE ADMINISTRATIVE INQUIRY BY THE ITALIAN AIR FORCE .....	47
1.1 <i>Introduction</i> .....	47
1.2 <i>Summary of the Air Force investigation report</i> .....	47
1.3 <i>Considerations</i> .....	50
2. THE TRENTO HEARINGS .....	50
2.1 <i>The dynamics of the incident and its precedents as reconstructed by the investigations of the Public Prosecutor's Office of the Court of Trento</i> .....	50
2.2 <i>The alleged irregularity of flight EASY 01</i> .....	54
2.3 <i>The position of Col. Orfeo Durigon</i> .....	56
2.4 <i>The aircrew's line of defense</i> .....	57
2.5 <i>The charges brought against individuals</i> .....	57
2.6 <i>The offenses for which committal for trial was requested</i> .....	60
2.7 <i>The issue of jurisdiction and the questions of constitutional legitimacy</i> .....	61
2.8 <i>The concluding requests of the Public Prosecutor to the examining magistrate of the Trento Court</i> .....	68
2.9 <i>The examining magistrate's decision</i> .....	68
3. THE MILITARY INQUIRY IN PADUA .....	74
3.1 <i>The investigation by the military prosecutor and the request for charges to be dismissed</i> .....	74
3.2 <i>The order for dismissal issued by the examining magistrate</i> .....	76
4. THE MILITARY INQUIRY IN BARI .....	79
4.1 <i>Arguments at the basis of the request for dismissal of criminal proceeding n° 29/99/IA/R.N.R. against Lieutenant Colonel Celestino Carratù</i> .....	83
4.2 <i>Motives for the order for dismissal by the examining magistrate of the Military Tribunal in Bari</i> .....	84

5. THE AMERICAN MILITARY ADMINISTRATIVE INQUIRY .....	85
5.1 <i>Report of the Command Investigation Board – Introduction</i> .....	85
5.2 <i>Standardization Agreement – STANAG 3531</i> .....	86
5.3 <i>Preliminary statement</i> .....	87
5.4 <i>Analysis of the Report</i> .....	91
6. THE TRIALS IN THE UNITED STATES .....	134
6.1 <i>The preliminary inquiry</i> .....	134
6.2 <i>The court martial of Capt. Richard J. Ashby for involuntary manslaughter and negligent homicide</i> .....	136
6.3 <i>The trial of Captain Joseph P. Schweitzer for obstruction of justice and conspiracy to obstruct justice</i> .....	139
6.4 <i>The trial against Capt. Richard J. Ashby for obstruction of justice and conspiracy to obstruct justice</i> .....	139
<b>PART IV – AN ATTEMPT TO ANALYZE THE RESPONSIBILITIES OF THOSE INVOLVED IN THE CERMIS AFFAIR</b> .....	143
1. INTRODUCTION .....	143
2. THE RESPONSIBILITY OF THE AIRCREW .....	143
2.1 <i>The nature of the aircrew's negligence</i> .....	143
2.2 <i>Willful negligence</i> .....	147
2.3 <i>The position of each member of the crew</i> .....	148
3. THE AMERICAN CHAIN OF COMMAND .....	150
3.1 <i>The Marine Corps</i> .....	150
3.2 <i>The VMAQ-2 Squadron</i> .....	154
3.3 <i>The 31st Fighter Wing of the US Air Force</i> .....	158
3.4 <i>Commander Striking Forces South (COMSTRIKEFOR SOUTH)</i> .....	159
4. THE ITALIAN CHAIN OF COMMAND .....	161
4.1 <i>The chain of command at Aviano and the COA/COM of Martina Franca</i> ...	161
<b>PART V – GENERAL ISSUES RAISED BY THE CERMIS MISHAP</b> .....	166
1. THE REGULATORY FRAMEWORK – TREATIES AND AGREEMENTS ..	166
1.1 <i>Introduction. The Treaty of Washington of 4 April 1949</i> .....	166
1.2 <i>International law</i> .....	168
1.3 <i>The structure, organization and use of military bases of NATO member</i>	170
2. THE PROBLEM OF THE RESERVATION OF JURISDICTION .....	172
2.1 <i>The reference regulatory framework</i> .....	172
2.2 <i>Determination of damage, payment procedures and the party responsible for payment</i> .....	177
3. AMENDING THE ITALIAN CIVIL AND CRIMINAL CODES .....	179
3.1 <i>Amendment of Article 589 of the Criminal Code or insertion of an Article 589-bis</i> .....	179
3.2 <i>Amendment of Article 590 of the Criminal Code or insertion of an Article 590-bis</i> .....	180
3.3 <i>The hypothesis of civil liability for damage caused by flight activities as an alternative punishment independent of the question of criminal liability</i> ...	181
4. REGULATION OF FLIGHT OPERATIONS .....	182
4.1 <i>Overview</i> .....	182
4.2 <i>Regulations for military flight operations. Low-level flights. Restrictions</i>	183
4.3 <i>Planning, executing and controlling flight operations</i> .....	191
4.4 <i>Considerations</i> .....	193

5. LOW-LEVEL FLIGHT .....	197
5.1 <i>Low-level flights and their impact on the civilian population</i> .....	197
6. ANALYSIS OF ACTIONS TAKEN AFTER THE DISASTER: JOINTLY- AGREED MEASURES AND THE TRICARICO-PRUEHER REPORT .....	202
6.1 <i>Measures adopted after the incident</i> .....	203
6.2 <i>Subsequent measures: the Tricarico-Prueher Report</i> .....	205
<b>PART VI – CONCLUSIONS AND PROPOSALS</b> .....	214
1. CONCLUSIONS AND PROPOSALS CONCERNING THE PRINCIPAL ISSUES TO EMERGE FROM THE COMMITTEE'S WORK .....	214
1.1 <i>The role of the judiciary</i> .....	214
1.2 <i>The responsibility of the aircrew</i> .....	214
1.3 <i>The responsibility of the American chain of command</i> .....	216
1.4 <i>Responsibility of Italian political, institutional and military authorities</i>	218
1.5 <i>Flight regulations</i> .....	219
1.6 <i>Measures adopted after the accident and the Tricarico-Prueher report</i>	220
1.7 <i>American initiatives: the Command Investigation Board and the court     martial</i> .....	222
1.8 <i>The inquiry by the Italian Air Force</i> .....	224
1.9 <i>Changes to international regulations</i> .....	224
1.10 <i>Modifications to Italian criminal and civil law</i> .....	226
<b>APPENDIX</b> .....	228
1. THE LEGAL CONTEXT .....	228
2. CHRONOLOGY OF EVENTS .....	230
3. GLOSSARY .....	236